rpm Revista Portuguesa de Musicologia
PORTUGUESE JOURNAL OF MUSICOLOGY
nova série | *new series*
6/2 (2019), pp. 447-454 ISSN 2183-8410
http://rpm-ns.pt

Review: Francesco Esposito, *'Um movimento musical como nunca houve em Portugal': Associativismo musical e vida concertística na Lisboa liberal (1822-1853)* (Lisboa, CESEM - Edições Colibri, 2016), 484 pp., ISBN: 978-989-689-509-9

Cristina Magaldi

Towson University
cmagaldi@towson.edu

UM MOVIMENTO MUSICAL COMO NUNCA HOUVE EM PORTUGAL': Associativismo musical e vida concertística na Lisboa liberal (1822-1853) unveils three decades of music making in nineteenth-century Lisbon, focusing on the growth of amateur and semi-professional societies and other organizations that promoted and sponsored concerts. Steering away from operatic performances and performances patronized by the monarchy, Francesco Esposito's work surveys the slow but visible transformations in the city's concert life, starting in 1822 with the beginning of the Sociedade Filarmónica and concluding with the death of D. Maria II in 1853. The book also addresses a complex system of music education still dependent on the local establishment and explores the social fabric of music organizations reliant on the patronage of the aristocracy and wealthy individuals. Although these three decades were politically unstable, the author argues that they were a period of transition that led to the active musical life that Lisbon's residents would eventually experience during the latter part of the century.

The book provides valuable data on the financial background of musical organizations, including musicians' payments and financial ties to different types of patrons; it includes records of the works performed at selected events and lists the participating musicians with their respective instruments. The substantial primary sources included in this work are accessible within the many chapters and sections via well-documented footnotes and facsimiles, as well as in lists within the chapters. Tables at the end of the book organize the data to allow for easy consultation. These indexes are in themselves precious sources for further research and are examples of what can be

accomplished through a meticulous examination of primary sources. The inclusion of footnotes offers immediate access to the sources and literature consulted, but the book lacks a bibliography—probably an editorial decision—which makes it difficult for the reader to track the general literature the author uses to frame his arguments.

The book is divided into two main sections, which are then subdivided into several smaller parts. The first section, covering from 1822-33, shows that the political situation at the beginning of the century in Europe and in Portugal made it difficult for local musicians to develop their musical skills and to earn a living. The author highlights the professional instability and insecurity of musicians in Lisbon during this period, who were mostly employed by theater orchestras, in church services, or were hired to perform in court celebrations. Contemporary records of musicians' hiring and reviews of their performances show that Portuguese musicians where often undercut in favor of foreign, mostly Italian, musicians, who dominated the musical milieu within and beyond the operatic theater. Primary sources and contemporary chronicles also reveal the difficulties of infiltrating traditional and well-established institutions, such as the Teatro de São Carlos and the Irmandade de Santa Cecília. In spite of these difficulties, this section accounts for the early efforts to modernize the local musical life and addresses the political and social changes that eventually led to more varied performances in the city.

The second section, covering from 1834-53, highlights the dominance of the Conde de Farrobo (as 'época farrobiana') in patronizing, promoting, and shaping musical performances. It also chronicles the many political and socio-cultural changes during D. Maria II's reign, focusing on the local advancement of liberalism. This was a period rendering a more balanced power at play in the control of local musical activities, as amateur associations devoted to music performance and the musicians themselves attempted to function beyond the grasp of the Irmandade de Santa Cecília and the dominance of the opera house. The changes would continue slowly but noticeably, favoring independent social organizations that supported and promoted concerts and that protected the professional and financial interests of local musicians. Among these organizations, the author traces the development of the Montepio Filarmónico, the Associação de Música 24 de Junho, and the Academia Melpomenense, while also exploring the importance of amateur societies with music and dances in the formation of an independent audience for music performances.

Within the several sections of the book, the author points to the connections between amateur and semi-professional musical organizations that promoted concerts and the events taking place in the city's theaters. He shows that local musicians had difficulty gaining access to the city's main stage, the Teatro de São Carlos, which was dominated by foreign operatic companies and powerful directors and managers. However, several 'secondary theaters' provided easier access for local musicians to have the performing spaces needed to organize their benefit concerts. Still, by mid-

century, when subscription concerts eventually became the preferred formula for the organization of public concerts, the costs of putting together a concert remained prohibitive for most, especially when local musicians lacked the rigorous education necessary to compete with performers coming from larger European musical centers.

As Esposito documents the shaping of city's concert life, he uncovers a network of musicians and patrons and their connections to the various theaters and performing venues. It becomes clear from the outset that the new organizations and societies promoting concerts were still intertwined with or reliant on, the power and prestige of the monarchical court, the local aristocracy, and the decision making and authority of powerful individuals, notably the pianist João Domingos Bomtempo and the Conde de Farrobo. At the same time, there are accounts of the activities of less prominent individuals who eventually became crucial players in the transformation of the city's musical life, being responsible for connecting developments in music education, musical performances, and music composition. The information on the activities of musicians such as José Avelino Canongia, João Guilherme Daddi, Francisco António Norberto dos Santos Pinto, and a myriad of other individuals who were the bedrocks of the day to day musical activities of the city, adds interest to the book's narrative, expanding the usual focus on the influence of the rich and powerful.

Among the data unveiled and analyzed in this book, the most significant undoubtedly refers to the repertory performed in the various concerts promoted by the new musical organizations. In the last chapter, Esposito's analysis points, for example, to the local preference for excerpts from French and Italian operas, and in particular for operatic sinfonias—Rossini's taking a prominent position. The focus is also on the importance of the 'sinfonia concertante' in establishing a taste for orchestral music among Lisbon's concert goers, and the addition of works by composers such as Mozart, Haydn, and Beethoven in local programs. The gradual change from a repertory dominated by Italian and French operatic derivatives to one marked by champions of the Austro-German musical tradition, the author argues, was the result of the growing number of music critics who participated in the emergent publishing business by writing chronicles and concert reviews, which in turn influenced the choices of musicians and program selection (pp. 387-92). The author also notes the association between music composition and political nationalism, which resulted in an increase of local composers in concert programs at mid-century.

The unveiling of seminal data is undoubtedly a hallmark of this publication and as such it is bound to become a reference work. Nonetheless, the interpretation of the data seems at times cursory, in particular the analysis of the social fabric of the local audiences who shaped the new musical organization and made it possible for them to flourish, and the role of an emergent transnational music markets that allowed for music performances and concerts to become

commercial enterprises. Multifaceted gender issues that complicated the boundaries of amateur and professional music making during the period are hardly considered.[1] Despite the centrality of women in the organization and establishment of amateur societies, as patrons, as performers, and as the main drive behind the growth of the music publishing business, this book's narrative is crowded by male performers, organizers, directors, patrons, and composers.

Ultimately, the analysis of primary sources and contemporary chronicles presented in the book leaves the reader with a picture of Lisbon's musical life by mid-century as a dynamic one, despite the shortcomings. Nonetheless, the author suggests at many points that Lisbon was 'behind' contemporary European cities in developing an autonomous professional milieu that supported independent musicians, that allowed for the growth of a modernized system of music education, and that encouraged the development of public concerts for instrumental and orchestral music independent from the monarch and the aristocracy. Indeed, Esposito claims that the book would help us to understand 'the lateness and difficulties in developing a "culture of concerts" in Lisbon' (p. 65) and to fathom why there was an 'amateur hypertropia' (p. 12, and pp. 177-210) in the city, while other European urban centers were developing a 'solid concert tradition' (p. 66). As various points of comparison are suggested throughout the book, it becomes clear soon enough that the author is echoing William Weber's 1975 analysis, having as references Paris, London, and Vienna.[2] And yet, much research on musical activities in nineteenth-century cities in Europe and across the Atlantic have shown that at mid-century Paris's and London's musical life were more exceptions than the rule. These cities had the largest urban population in Europe and enjoyed urban developments that most contemporary cities lacked, not only Lisbon.[3] Paris and London were the

[1] The only direct analysis of gender roles is summarized as follows (author's translation): 'Gender shaped two major tendencies: the first referred to the financial and professional aspects of musical life, which was dominated by males, mostly foreigners and the aristocracy; and the second group was made by amateur societies and social gatherings, which was dominated by women, that favored vocal music in their concerts' (p. 99).

[2] William WEBER, *Music and the Middle Class: The Social Structure of Concert Life in London, Paris and Vienna between 1830 and 1848* (New York, Holmes & Meier, 1975). In a footnote on page 66, Esposito refers specifically to Paris and Vienna.

[3] In 1850 London's population was 2,320,000 and Paris 1,314,000, far distant numbers from the next largest cities like Berlin, St. Petersburg, Vienna, and New York, with 446,000, 502,000, 500,000, 590,000 respectively; Lisbon's population of about 270,000 (or 350,000 if counting the surrounding areas) was more in line with contemporary cities in Italy (Rome, Milan, Venice), as well as Amsterdam and Madrid. On the other side of the Atlantic, cities with concert organizations somewhat similar to what the author explores in Lisbon was Rio de Janeiro with 200,000 habitants, Buenos Aires with about 180,000, and Philadelphia and Boston, although they had smaller populations of 200,000. For city comparison in terms of population and overall urban developments in the nineteenth century see, Jürgen OSTERHAMMEL'S *The Transformation of the World: A Global History of the Nineteenth Century* (Princeton - NJ, Princeton University Press, 2009), in particular chapter 6 'Cities; European Models and Worldwide Creativity'. For comparisons about urban developments, theaters, commercial entertainment venues, patronage and paying public, and audience tastes see John CARNELLEY'S *George Smart and Concert Life in Nineteenth-Century London* (Woodbridge - UK, Boydell Press, 2015), especially chapter four, where there is a comparison among the concert activities of London, Berlin, Vienna, Leipzig, and Paris; for comparison between Berlin and Leipzig see Sanna PEDERSON A. B. MARX, 'Berlin Concert Life, and German National Identity', *19th-Century Music*, 18/2 (Fall 1994), pp. 87-107; for the specific situation of London in comparison with other European cities see Simon MCVEIGH, 'A Free Trade in Music: London

political and commercial centers of the Western world; they capitalized on their imperialistic power to make possible the modernization and urbanization that also allowed for advances in musical activities. And it was exactly Paris and London's exceptionality that led them to become models for many cities, including Lisbon.

Still, while some residents in various cities in Europe and across the Atlantic aspired that their city become just like Paris, this aspiration also created an imagined, and misguided, ideal of the actual urban transformations, and the transformations in music making, taking place in large urban centers. In fact, while the aristocratic patronage system was in flux at the beginning of the nineteenth century, a private, commercial concert tradition independent from the opera house was very much a work in progress across Europe, including in Paris, London, and Vienna, and was still largely dependent on the influence of powerful and wealthy individuals and the aristocracy. During the first part of the century, amateur musicians made up the largest performance groups in Paris and Vienna, and even the most well-known soloists had to fiercely negotiate with powerful directors and managers to guarantee a stage for their benefit concerts. The most well-known society for musical performances in early nineteenth-century Vienna, the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde (Society of Friends of the Music), for example, was reliant on aristocratic donors and on amateur performers, who were also patrons, and depended on the city's stages and aristocratic salons to organize their concerts and other activities until the 1830s, when a proper building served as a dedicated space. Not until the 1840s did large orchestras started to function as semi-independent and commercial organizations. The Vienna Philharmonic, initially made up solely of court musicians, started in 1842 as the city's first professional orchestra. And although it claimed financial independence, it was not insulated from political problems and did not managed to function regularly until the 1860s. The many concert organizations of mid-century Paris also could not claim to be exempt from the dependency on the patronage of aristocracy for concerts and relied heavily on amateurs, students, and semi-professional musicians to put together concert series that operated on a semi-regular basis.[4]

---

during the Long 19th Century in a European Perspective', *Journal of Modern European History*, 5/1 (2007), pp. 67-94. See also, Joseph de SAPIO, *Modernity and Meaning in Victorian London* (London, Macmillan, 2014). The standard study for Paris continues to be James JOHNSON, *Listening in Paris: A Cultural History* (Berkeley - Los Angeles, University of California Press, 1995), specifically the chapter 'The Birth of the Public Concert' where he shows the difficulty of forming a public independently from the court. For Vienna's conservative musical life during the first part of the nineteenth century, see *Music in Biedermeier Vienna* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2009). For a comparison within Portugal see Ana Maria LIBERAL, 'Music Societies in the 19th Century Oporto: Private Spaces of Amateur and Professional Music Making', *Journal of Science and Technology of the Arts*, 1/1 (2009), pp. 53-71, and Gabriela CRUZ, 'Sr. José, the Worker *mélomane*, or Opera and Democracy in Lisbon ca. 1850', *19th-Century Music*, 40/2 (Fall 2016), pp. 81-105.

[4] This was the case, of course, with the establishment of Parisian concert societies early in the nineteenth century, such as the Société des concerts du conservatoire (1828).

Likewise, in the first part of the nineteenth century, long programs with a variety of short pieces were the standard format for concerts programming not only Lisbon, but also in many contemporary cities. And Lisbon's audiences were not alone in fancying opera and operatic derivatives, for during this period it was difficult to disassociate operatic and theatrical performances from the repertories performed at concerts promoted by amateurs. And as a matter of fact, the overflow of Italian musicians as competitors to locals was an issue faced by musicians in cities throughout Europe and across the Atlantic. Thus, given the intricate social process of early professionalization of music activities and audience formation, it is difficult to define a 'concert life' or a 'concert tradition' disassociated from the opera house and from wealthy donors. Additionally, Vienna was indeed the center of the classical tradition in the first decades of the century, but Beethoven had difficulty getting his symphonies performed and published. They were simply not profitable, as publishers relied on shorter pieces for smaller ensembles, transcriptions and arrangements, or vocal solos with accompaniment to make a profit. Full symphonies were also not easy sells for concert programing anywhere during this period, considering, among other challenges, the size of orchestras and the musicians' skills needed to perform them, and not mention the controversial discussions behind the idea that instrumental music could mean something if disassociated from drama.[5]

These points should not undermine the richness of material unveiled in this book, nor are these facts entirely overlooked by the author.[6] The case to make here is that Esposito's thorough research opportunely leaves the door open for further studies that will place the information into a larger context. Esposito's interpretation of primary sources ultimately shows that Lisbon was not really 'behind' but rather that it was much in sync with several contemporary cities similar in size and with similar established monarchial systems and powerful aristocratic patrons. Esposito's welcome book thus provides much needed raw data that will not only add immensely to the available research on music making in Lisbon but will also enable a larger comparative history of urban music making in the early nineteenth-century Western world.

[5] Mark Evan Bonds explores the socio-political and philosophical discussions about finding meaning in instrumental music during the first decades of the nineteenth century, a discussion that continued throughout the century and is indeed much alive today; see his *Music as Thought: Listening to the Symphony in the Age of Beethoven* (Princeton - N. J., Princeton University Press, 2006); see also CARNELLEY'S *George Smart and Concert Life* (see note 3).

[6] This is clear from the extended footnotes included on pages 66, 75-6, 78, 140-1, and in various shorter notes regarding concert in other European cities.

Cristina Magaldi holds a bachelor's degree from the University of Brasilia, a Master of Music from Reading University, and a Ph.D. from the University of California, Los Angeles. Magaldi's areas of study include music in Latin America, Brazilian music, music and globalization, music and nationalism, popular music, and music and gender. She teaches at Towson University and is the author of *Music in Imperial Rio de Janeiro: European Culture in a Tropical Milieu* (Scarecrow Press, 2004); her articles have appeared in *Latin American Music Review, Inter-American Music Review, Revista de Musicología, Claves, Popular Music*, and *The Musical Quarterly*. Magaldi also has articles in *The New Grove Music Dictionary of Women Composers, The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, and in the *Musikalische Geschichte und Gegenwart*.